

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

CHAPTER 2
CONTESTED CASE HEARINGS

Section 1. Purpose and Scope.

These rules are promulgated with the intent to adopt as much of the uniform contested case rules that the Office of Administrative Hearings adopted under W.S. 16-3-102(d) as is consistent with the specific and distinct requirements of the Department and the Council and applicable law. These rules shall govern all contested case proceedings before the Council.

Section 2. Applicability of the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure.

The Council shall conduct all contested case hearings with reference to the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure. Section 26 of this chapter specifically incorporates Rules 11, 12(b)(6), 24, 45, 52, 56, and 56.1 of the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure.

Section 3. Informal Proceedings and Alternative Dispute Resolution.

(a) Parties to a contested case are encouraged to resolve the contested case through settlement, mediation, arbitration, or other means throughout the duration of a contested case. If the parties choose to engage in mediation or arbitration, they shall file a joint request for continuance pending outcome of the mediation or arbitration. If the parties choose to engage in informal settlement discussions, they may file a joint request for continuance pending outcome of the informal settlement discussions.

(b) With the consent of all parties, the hearing officer may assign a contested case to a mediating hearing officer on limited assignment for the purpose of nonbinding alternative dispute resolution methods. Such methods shall be conducted in accordance with the procedures prescribed by the mediating hearing officer.

(c) Parties shall promptly notify the hearing officer of all settlements, stipulations, agency orders, or other action eliminating the need for a contested case hearing. The hearing officer shall forward such notice to the Council. Upon such notice, the Council shall enter an order dismissing the case.

Section 4. Initiation of Contested Case.

(a) All persons requesting a contested case hearing or protesting a permit shall file the original written petition with the Council and serve additional copies to the Director of the Department and any other parties.

(i) A person initiating a contested case shall serve the petition by registered mail, return receipt requested. Thereafter, all service shall be proved in accordance with the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure.

(ii) Where a person is objecting to a permit, service of all documents shall

47 include the permit applicant when serving the petition and all other pleadings and motions.

48

49 (b) The petition for hearing shall set forth:

50

51 (i) Name, phone number, electronic mail address, and physical address of the
52 petitioner and, if applicable, the petitioner's attorney;

53

54 (ii) The action, decision, order, or permit upon which a hearing is requested;

55

56 (iii) A statement in ordinary but concise language of the specific allegations on
57 which the petition is based, including references to the statute, rule, or order that the petitioner
58 alleges has been violated, and

59

60 (iv) A request for hearing before the Council.

61

62 (c) The contested case shall be deemed commenced on the date of filing the petition
63 with the Council.

64

65 (d) No responsive pleadings are mandatory prior to the prehearing scheduling
66 conference.

67

68 **Section 5. Filing and Service of Papers**

69

70 (a) In all contested case proceedings, the parties shall file all original documents,
71 pleadings, and motions with the Council and serve all other parties with true and correct copies
72 of the particular document, pleading, or motion. The original and all copies shall be
73 accompanied by a certificate of service. The Council shall maintain the complete original file,
74 and all parties and the hearing officer shall be provided copies of all contested case documents,
75 pleadings, and motions contained therein.

76

77 (b) Filing and service under this rule shall be made by hand delivery, U.S. mail
78 transmittal to the last known address, or electronically uploaded to the relevant docket at
79 <http://wyomingeqc.wyo.gov/>. Where all parties have not consented to receive electronic service,
80 the party electronically filing shall otherwise serve the documents to the parties who have not
81 consented to receive electronic service. Parties may file by means other than those described in
82 this Section upon approval from the hearing officer.

83

84 **Section 6. Referral to Office.**

85

86 (a) Upon referral to the Office to conduct a contested case in accordance with W.S.
87 35-11-112(a), the Council shall transmit to the Office copies of appropriate documents
88 reflecting the dispute and the basis thereof, including any written challenge(s) initiating the
89 contested case and a reference to applicable law.

90

91 (b) The Council shall submit a transmittal sheet, on a form provided by the
92 Office, sufficiently identifying the contested case, including:

93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138

(i) The name of the known parties and their attorneys or representatives;

(ii) A concise statement of the nature of the contested case;

(iii) Notification of any time limits for the setting of a hearing or entry of a decision, location requirements, and anticipated special features or unique requirements; and

(iv) Certification by an authorized officer of the Council that all parties have been properly served with a true and complete copy of the transmittal form.

Section 7. Designation and Authority of Hearing Officer; Recusal.

(a) The Chair may refer, assign, or designate a hearing officer to preside over any contested case unless otherwise provided by law. When appropriate under applicable law and at the Council's request, the hearing officer may provide a recommended decision.

(b) At any time while a contested case is pending, a hearing officer or Council member may withdraw from a contested case by filing written notice of recusal or entering a verbal notice of recusal into the record. As soon as the notice of recusal is entered, the recused hearing officer or Council member shall not participate in the contested case.

(c) Upon motion of any party, recusal of a hearing officer or Council member shall be for cause. Whenever the grounds for such motion become known, any party may move for recusal of a hearing officer or Council member on the ground that the hearing officer or Council member:

(i) Has been engaged as counsel in the action prior to being appointed as hearing officer;

(ii) Has a material interest in the outcome of the action;

(iii) Is related by consanguinity to a party;

(iv) Is a witness in the action;

(v) Is biased or prejudiced against the party or the party's attorney or representative; or

(vi) Any other ground provided by law.

(d) A motion for recusal shall be supported by an affidavit or affidavits of any person or persons stating sufficient facts to show the existence of grounds for the motion. Prior to a hearing on the motion, any party may file counter-affidavits. The motion shall be heard by the hearing officer or, at the discretion of the hearing officer, by another hearing officer. If the motion is granted, the Council Chair shall immediately designate another hearing officer to

139 preside over the contested case or shall excuse the Council member(s).
 140

141 (e) A hearing officer appointed from outside the Council members shall not be
 142 subject to a voir dire examination by any party.
 143

144 (f) Subject to limitations imposed by the hearing officer, any party may be
 145 permitted to conduct a voir dire examination of a Council member.
 146

147 **Section 8. Appearances and Withdrawals.** 148

149 (a) A party, whether it be an individual, corporation, partnership, governmental
 150 organization, or other entity may appear through an attorney or representative. An individual
 151 may represent himself/herself. An individual or entity seeking to intervene in a contested case
 152 under Rule 24 of the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure may appear through an attorney or
 153 representative prior to a ruling on the motion to intervene.
 154

155 (b) Prior to withdrawing from a contested case, an attorney shall file a motion to
 156 withdraw. The motion for an attorney's withdrawal shall include a statement indicating the
 157 manner in which notification was given to the client and setting forth the client's last known
 158 address and telephone number. The hearing officer shall not grant the motion to withdraw
 159 unless the attorney has made reasonable efforts to give actual notice to the client that:
 160

161 (i) The attorney wishes to withdraw;
 162

163 (ii) The client has the burden of keeping the hearing officer informed of
 164 the address where notices, pleadings, or other papers may be served;
 165

166 (iii) The client has the obligation to prepare, or to hire another attorney
 167 or representative to prepare, for the contested case and the dates of proceedings;
 168

169 (iv) The client may suffer an adverse determination in the contested case if
 170 the client fails or refuses to meet these burdens;
 171

172 (v) The pleadings and papers in the case shall be served upon the client at the
 173 client's last known address; and
 174

175 (vi) The client has the right to object within fifteen (15) days of the date of
 176 notice.
 177

178 (c) Prior to withdrawing from a contested case, a representative shall provide
 179 written notice of withdrawal to the Council.
 180

181 **Section 9. Intervention.** 182

183 (a) Any person interested in obtaining the relief sought by a party or otherwise
 184 interested in the determination of a proceeding, other than surface coal mining operations

185 pending before the Council, may file a motion to intervene before or at the hearing, but not
 186 thereafter except for good cause shown. The motion shall set forth the grounds of the proposed
 187 intervention, the position and interest of the petitioner in the proceeding, and affirmative relief
 188 sought. Leave shall not be granted unless the Council determines that the movant is adversely
 189 affected by the action and has a legal right to intervene, under the standards set out in W.R.C.P.
 190 Rule 24.

191
 192 (b) For proceedings related to surface coal mining operations, any person may file a
 193 motion for leave to intervene as a full party or in a limited capacity at any stage of a proceeding
 194 conducted by the Council. The motion shall include the basis for intervention and shall be
 195 granted to any person who either could have initiated the proceeding or has an interest that may
 196 be adversely affected by the outcome of the proceeding. Regardless of these bases, intervention
 197 may be granted whenever appropriate after considering the nature of the issues, the adequacy of
 198 the existing parties' representation of movant's interest, the ability of the movant to present
 199 relevant evidence and argument, and the effect of intervention on the implementation of the
 200 Wyoming Environmental Quality Act. The extent and terms of participation by an intervenor in
 201 a limited capacity shall be determined by the Council.

202
 203 (c) If the motion to intervene is granted, the movant becomes an intervenor and a
 204 party to the proceeding with the right to have notice, appear at the taking of testimony, produce
 205 and cross-examine witnesses, and be heard on the argument of the case. The party
 206 intervening shall give notice of intervention to all other parties.

207 208 **Section 10. Ex Parte Communications.**

209
 210 Except as authorized by law, a party or a party's attorney or representative shall not
 211 communicate with any Council member in connection with any issue of fact or law concerning
 212 any pending contested case, except upon notice and opportunity for all parties to participate.
 213 Should ex parte communication occur, the Council member shall advise all parties of the
 214 communication as soon as possible thereafter and, if requested, shall allow any party an
 215 opportunity to respond prior to ruling on the issue.

216 217 **Section 11. Motions and Motion Practice.**

218
 219 (a) Unless these rules or an order of the hearing officer establish time limitations
 220 other than those contained herein, all motions except motions for enlargement of time and
 221 motions made during hearing shall be served at least ten (10) days prior to the hearing on the
 222 motion. A party affected by the motion may serve a response together with affidavits, if
 223 any, at least three (3) days before the hearing on the motion or within twenty (20) days after
 224 service of the motion, whichever is earlier. Unless the hearing officer permits service at some
 225 other time, the moving party may serve a reply, if any, at least one day prior to the hearing on
 226 the motion or within fifteen (15) days after service of the response, whichever is earlier. Unless
 227 the hearing officer otherwise orders, any party may serve supplemental memoranda or
 228 rebuttal affidavits at least one day prior to the hearing on the motion.

229
 230 (b) Unless the hearing officer otherwise orders, a request for a hearing on the motion

231 may be served by the moving party or any party affected by the motion within twenty (20)
232 days after service of the motion. The hearing officer may determine such motion without a
233 hearing.

234

235 (c) Prior to filing any non-dispositive motion, a moving party shall make
236 reasonable efforts to contact all other parties, representatives, and attorneys. Any such non-
237 dispositive motion shall include a statement concerning efforts made to confer with the other
238 party(s) and position(s) on the motion.

239

240 (d) All written motions filed with the Council shall be accompanied by a proposed
241 order.

242

243 **Section 12. Setting Hearings and Other Proceedings.**

244

245 (a) The hearing officer or Chair of the Council, as applicable, shall assign a docket
246 number to each contested case. All papers, pleadings, motions, and orders filed thereafter shall
247 contain:

248

249 (i) A conspicuous reference to the assigned docket number;

250

251 (ii) A caption setting forth the title of the contested case and a brief
252 designation describing the document filed; and

253

254 (iii) The name, address, telephone number, and signature of the person
255 who prepared the document.

256

257 (b) The hearing officer shall set the course of proceedings through the issuance of a
258 scheduling order. This may include, but is not limited to, pre-hearing conferences,
259 confidentiality issues, summary disposition deadlines, motion practice,
260 settlement conferences, and the evidentiary hearing.

261

262 (c) Prehearing conferences may be held at the discretion of the hearing officer. Any
263 party may request a prehearing conference to address issues such as discovery, motion
264 deadlines, scheduling orders, or case status.

265

266 (d) At the hearing officer's discretion and unless otherwise provided by the
267 Council, telephone or videoconference calls may be used to conduct any proceeding. At the
268 discretion of the hearing officer, parties or their witnesses may be allowed to participate in
269 any hearing by telephone or videoconference.

270

271 **Section 13. Consolidation.**

272

273 A party may seek consolidation of two or more contested cases by filing a motion to
274 consolidate in each case sought to be consolidated. If consolidation is ordered and unless
275 otherwise ordered by the hearing officer, all subsequent filings shall be in the case first filed,
276 and all previous filings related to the consolidated cases shall be placed together under that

277 docket number. Consolidation may be ordered on a hearing officer's own motion.
278

279 **Section 14. Continuances and Extensions of Time.**

280

281 (a) A motion for a continuance of any scheduled hearing shall be in writing, state
282 the reasons for the motion, and be filed and served on all parties and the hearing officer. A
283 motion for a continuance shall be granted only upon a showing of good cause.
284

285

286 (b) A motion for an extension of time for performing any act prescribed or
287 allowed by these rules or by order of the hearing officer shall be filed and served on all parties
288 and the hearing officer prior to the expiration of the applicable time period. A motion for
289 extension of time shall be granted only upon a showing of good cause.

290

291 (c) For contested cases conducted regarding objections pursuant to W.S. 35-11-
292 406(k), a motion for continuance may not be granted if the motion would continue the hearing
293 beyond the 20-day period provided in that statute unless the parties stipulate to a different
294 period.

295

296 **Section 15. Discovery.**

297

298 (a) The taking of depositions and discovery shall be in accordance with
299 W.S. 16-3-107(g).

300

301 (b) Unless the hearing officer orders otherwise, parties shall not file discovery
302 requests, answers, and deposition notices with the Council.

303

304 **Section 16. Subpoenas.**

305

306 Any party may request the hearing officer to issue a subpoena to compel the attendance
307 of a witness or for the production of documents. Requests for a subpoena shall be
308 accompanied by a completed subpoena that conforms to Rule 45 of the Wyoming Rules of
309 Civil Procedure.

310

311 **Section 17. Summary Disposition.**

312

313 Rules 12(b)(6), 52(c), 56.1, and 56, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, apply to
314 contested cases.

315

316 **Section 18. Prehearing Procedures.**

317

318 (a) Unless otherwise ordered by the hearing officer, each party to a contested case
319 shall file and serve on all other parties and the hearing officer a prehearing disclosure statement
320 setting forth:

321

322 (i) A complete list of all witnesses who will or may testify, together with
information on how that witness may be contacted, and a brief description of the testimony the

323 witness is expected to give in the case. If a deposition is to be offered into evidence, the original
324 shall be filed with the Council;

325
326 (ii) A statement of the specific claims, defenses, and issues which the
327 party asserts are before the hearing officer for hearing, based on the party's initial filing;

328
329 (iii) A statement of the burden of proof to be assigned in the contested case
330 with reference to specific regulatory, statutory, constitutional, or other authority established by
331 relevant case law;

332
333 (iv) A statement of stipulated facts. If the parties are unable to stipulate to
334 facts, the parties shall indicate what efforts have been made to stipulate to facts and the reasons
335 facts cannot be stipulated;

336
337 (v) A complete list of all documents, statements, etc., which the party will or
338 may introduce into evidence; and

339
340 (vi) An approximation of the time required for the hearing.

341
342 (b) Parties shall file and serve prehearing disclosure statements on or before the
343 date established by the hearing officer.

344
345 (c) The information provided in a prehearing disclosure statement shall be binding on
346 each party throughout the course of the contested case unless modified for good cause.

347
348 (d) Additional witnesses or exhibits may be added only if the need to do so was
349 not reasonably foreseeable at the time of filing of the prehearing disclosure statement, it would
350 not unfairly prejudice other parties, and good cause is shown.

351
352 (e) The hearing officer may modify the requirements of a prehearing disclosure
353 statement.

354
355 (f) Failure to file a prehearing disclosure statement may result in the hearing
356 officer's striking of witnesses, exhibits, claims and defenses, or dismissal of the contested case.

357
358 (g) If a prehearing order is entered, the prehearing order shall control the
359 course of the hearing.

360
361 **Section 19. Burden of Proof.**

362
363 The hearing officer shall assign the burden of proof in accordance with applicable
364 law.

365
366 **Section 20. Evidence.**

367
368 (a) The hearing officer shall rule on the admissibility of evidence in accordance

369 with the following:

370

371 (i) Evidence of the type commonly relied upon by reasonably prudent
372 persons in the conduct of their serious affairs shall be admissible. Irrelevant, immaterial, or
373 unduly repetitious evidence shall be excluded.

374

375 (ii) Evidence may be offered through witness testimony or in
376 documentary form;

377

378 (iii) Testimony shall be given under oath administered by the hearing
379 officer. Deposition testimony and other pre-filed testimony may be submitted as evidence,
380 provided the testimony is given under oath administered by an appropriate authority, and is
381 subject to cross-examination by all parties;

382

383 (iv) The rules of privilege recognized by Wyoming law shall be given
384 effect; and

385

386 (v) A hearing officer may take administrative notice of judicially
387 cognizable facts, provided the parties are properly notified of any material facts noticed.

388

389 (b) Each party shall have the opportunity to cross-examine witnesses. The
390 hearing officer may allow cross-examination on matters not covered on direct examination.
391 Each party shall have the opportunity to perform re-direct examination of witnesses on matters
392 covered during cross-examination.

393

394 (c) The hearing officer or Council member, when applicable, may ask questions of
395 any party or witness.

396

397 **Section 21. Contested Case Hearing Procedure.**

398

399 (a) The hearing officer shall conduct the contested case and shall have discretion to
400 direct the order of the proceedings.

401

402 (b) Unless otherwise provided by law, and at the hearing officer's discretion, the
403 party with the burden of proof shall be the first to present evidence. All other parties
404 shall be allowed to cross-examine witnesses in an orderly fashion. When that party rests,
405 other parties shall then be allowed to present their evidence. Rebuttal and surrebuttal evidence
406 shall be allowed only at the discretion of the hearing officer.

407

408 (c) The hearing officer shall have discretion to allow opening statements and
409 closing arguments.

410

411 **Section 22. Default.**

412

413 Unless otherwise provided by law, a hearing officer may enter an order of default or
414 an order affirming agency action for a party's failure to appear at a lawfully noticed hearing.

415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460

Section 22. Expedited Hearing.

(a) At the hearing officer's or Council's discretion and when allowed by applicable law, a contested case may be heard as an expedited hearing upon the motion of any party.

(b) An expedited hearing shall be decided on written arguments, evidence, and stipulations submitted by the parties. A hearing officer or the Council may permit oral arguments upon the request of any party.

(c) The hearing officer may require an evidentiary hearing in any case in which it appears that facts material to a decision in the case cannot be properly determined by an expedited hearing.

Section 24. Recommended Decision.

In those contested cases where the hearing officer makes a recommended decision, the hearing officer shall file the recommended decision with the Council and serve copies of the recommended decision on all parties to the contested case. Unless otherwise ordered, parties shall have ten (10) days to file written exceptions to the hearing officer's recommended decision. Written exceptions shall be filed with the Council and served on all parties.

Section 25. Final Decision.

(a) A final decision containing findings of fact, conclusions of law, and an order entered by the Council shall be in writing and served upon all parties to the contested case and the hearing officer, if applicable.

(b) A final decision shall include findings of fact and conclusions of law, separately stated. When the hearing officer allows the parties to submit a proposed final order, the parties shall file the original with the Council and serve copies of the proposed order on all other parties and the hearing officer.

(c) A hearing officer may at any time prior to judicial review correct clerical errors in final decisions or other parts of the record. A party may move that clerical errors or other parts of the record be corrected. During the pendency of judicial review, such errors may be corrected only with leave of the court having jurisdiction.

Section 26. Incorporation by Reference.

(a) The code, standard, rule, or regulation below is incorporated by reference and can be found at:

http://www.courts.state.wy.us/Documents/CourtRules/Rules/WYOMING_RULES_OF_CIVIL_PROCEDURE.pdf

461 (i) Rule 11, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
462 Supreme Court and in effect on March 1, 2017;

463
464 (ii) Rule 12(b)(6), Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the
465 Wyoming Supreme Court and in effect on March 1, 2017;

466
467 (iii) Rule 24, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
468 Supreme Court and in effect on March 1, 2017;

469
470 (iv) Rule 45, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
471 Supreme Court and in effect on March 1, 2017;

472
473 (v) Rule 52, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
474 Supreme Court and in effect on March 1, 2017;

475
476 (vi) Rule 56, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
477 Supreme Court and in effect on March 1, 2017;

478
479 (vii) Rule 56.1, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
480 Supreme Court and in effect on March 1, 2017.

481
482 (b) These rules do not incorporate later amendments or editions of the incorporated
483 matter.

484
485 (c) All incorporated matter is available for public inspection at the Department's
486 Cheyenne office or at the Council's Cheyenne office. Contact information for the Department's
487 Cheyenne office may be obtained at <http://deq.wyoming.gov/> or from (307) 777-7937. Contact
488 information for the Council's Cheyenne office may be obtained at <http://wyomingeqc.wyo.gov/>
489 or from (307) 777-7170.