DRAFT 03/22/17

CHAPTER 2 1 2 **CONTESTED CASE HEARINGS** 3 4 Section 1. Purpose and Scope. 5 6 These rules are promulgated with the intent to adopt as much of the Chapter 2 Rules 7 for Contested Case Practice and Procedure before the Office of Administrative Hearings 8 (OAH Rules) adopted under W.S. 16-3-102(d) as is consistent with the specific and distinct 9 requirements of the Department and the Council and applicable law. These rules shall govern all 10 contested case proceedings before the Council. 11 12 Section 2. Applicability of the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure. 13 14 The Council shall conduct all contested case hearings with reference to the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure. Section 26 of this chapter specifically incorporates Rules 11, 12(b)(6), 15 16 24, 45, 52, 56, and 56.1 of the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure. 17 18 Section 3. Informal Proceedings and Alternative Dispute Resolution. 19 20 (a) Parties to a contested case are encouraged to resolve the contested case through settlement, mediation, arbitration, or other means throughout the duration of a contested case. 21 22 If the parties choose to engage in mediation or arbitration, they shall file a joint request for 23 continuance pending outcome of the mediation or arbitration. If the parties choose to engage in 24 informal settlement discussions, they may file a joint request for continuance pending outcome of the informal settlement discussions. 25 26 27 With the consent of all parties, the hearing officer may assign a contested case to a mediating hearing officer on limited assignment for the purpose of nonbinding alternative 28 29 dispute resolution methods. Such methods shall be conducted in accordance with the procedures prescribed by the mediating hearing officer. 30 31 32 Parties shall promptly notify the hearing officer of all settlements, stipulations, agency orders, or other action eliminating the need for a contested case hearing. The hearing 33 34 officer shall forward such notice to the Council. Upon such notice, the Council shall enter an 35 order dismissing the case. 36 37 **Section 4. Initiation of Contested Case.** 38 39 All persons requesting a contested case hearing or protesting a permit shall file the original written petition with the Council and serve additional copies to the Director of the 40 Department and any other parties. 41 42 43 (i) A person initiating a contested case shall serve the petition by registered 44 mail, return receipt requested. Thereafter, all service shall be proved in accordance with the

45

46

Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure.

47 48	include the po	(ii) ermit ap	Where a person is objecting to a permit, service of all documents shall plicant when serving the petition and all other pleadings and motions.		
49					
50	(b)	The pe	etition for hearing shall set forth:		
51		-			
52		(i)	Name, phone number, electronic mail address, and physical address of the		
53	petitioner and	d, if appl	licable, the petitioner's attorney;		
54	1	, 11	, 1		
55		(ii)	The action, decision, order, or permit upon which a hearing is requested;		
56		` /			
57		(iii)	A statement in ordinary but concise language of the specific allegations on		
58	which the pet	` /	based, including references to the statute, rule, or order that the petitioner		
59	alleges has be				
60					
61		(iv)	A request for hearing before the Council.		
62		(- ·)	1		
63	(c)	The co	ontested case shall be deemed commenced on the date of filing the petition		
64	with the Cour				
65	,,				
66	(d)	No res	sponsive pleadings are mandatory prior to the prehearing scheduling		
67	conference.				
68					
69	Section	on 5. Fil	ling and Service of Papers		
70					
71	(a)	In all	contested case proceedings, the parties shall file all original documents,		
72	` '		ns with the Council and serve all other parties with true and correct copies		
73			iment, pleading, or motion. The original and all copies shall be		
74	accompanied by a certificate of service. The Council shall maintain the complete original file,				
75	and all parties and the hearing officer shall be provided copies of all contested case documents,				
76	_		ns contained therein.		
77	1 67				
78	(b)	Filing	g and service under this rule shall be made by hand delivery, U.S. mail		
79			known address, or electronically uploaded to the relevant docket at		
80	http://wyomingeqc.wyo.gov/. Where all parties have not consented to receive electronic service,				
81			ly filing shall otherwise serve the documents to the parties who have not		
82			electronic service. Parties may file by means other than those described in		
83			proval from the hearing officer.		
84					
85	Section	on 6. Re	ferral to Office.		
86					
87	(a)	Upon	referral to the Office to conduct a contested case in accordance with W.S.		
88	, ,	-	uncil shall transmit to the Office copies of appropriate documents		
89			and the basis thereof, including any written challenge(s) initiating the		
90	contested case and a reference to applicable law.				
91			••		
92	(b)	The C	Council shall submit a transmittal sheet, on a form provided by the		

93	Office, sufficie	ently ide	ntifying the contested case, including:
94 95		(i)	The name of the known parties and their attorneys or representatives;
95 96		(1)	The name of the known parties and their attorneys of representatives,
97 98		(ii)	A concise statement of the nature of the contested case;
99		(iii	Notification of any time limits for the setting of a hearing or entry of a
100 101	decision, locat	•	irements, and anticipated special features or unique requirements; and
101		(iv)	Certification by an authorized officer of the Council that all parties have
103	been properly		with a true and complete copy of the transmittal form.
104	oven property	, , , ,	the warm complete copy of the transmitten forms
105	Section	1 7. Desi	ignation and Authority of Hearing Officer; Recusal.
106 107	(a)	The Ch	air may refer, assign, or designate a hearing officer to preside over any
107 108 109	contested case	unless	otherwise provided by law. When appropriate under applicable law and st, the hearing officer may provide a recommended decision.
110		2 4	,, F
111	(b)	At any	time while a contested case is pending, a hearing officer or Council
112	member may v	withdrav	v from a contested case by filing written notice of recusal or entering a
113	verbal notice of	of recusa	l into the record. As soon as the notice of recusal is entered, the recused
114	hearing officer	or Cou	ncil member shall not participate in the contested case.
115			
116	(c)	-	notion of any party, recusal of a hearing officer or Council member shall
117			er the grounds for such motion become known, any party may move for
118		aring of	ficer or Council member on the ground that the hearing officer or Council
119	member:		
120		(*)	
121	1 ' CC'		Has been engaged as counsel in the action prior to being appointed as
122	hearing officer	;	
123 124		(ii)	Has a material interest in the outcome of the action;
125		(ii)	rias a material interest in the outcome of the action,
126		(iii)	Is related by consanguinity to a party;
127		(111)	is related by consumguinity to a party,
128		(iv)	Is a witness in the action;
129		(11)	25 W 11 2020 555 220 W.
130		(v)	Is biased or prejudiced against the party or the party's attorney or
131	representative;	. ,	
132	,		
133		(vi)	Any other ground provided by law.
134			-
135	(d)	A moti	on for recusal shall be supported by an affidavit or affidavits of any
136	-		ing sufficient facts to show the existence of grounds for the motion. Prior
137	_		otion, any party may file counter-affidavits. The motion shall be heard
138	by the hearing	g office	r or, at the discretion of the hearing officer, by another hearing officer. If

the motion is granted, the Council Chair shall immediately designate preside over the contested case or shall excuse the Council member(s		
(e) A hearing officer appointed from outside the Council r subject to a voir dire examination by any party.	nembers shall not be	
(f) Subject to limitations imposed by the hearing officer permitted to conduct a voir dire examination of a Council member.	c, any party may be	
Section 8. Appearances and Withdrawals.		
(a) A party, whether it be an individual, corporation, partner organization, or other entity may appear through an attorney or rep may represent himself/herself. An individual or entity seeking to interunder Rule 24 of the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure may appear representative prior to a ruling on the motion to intervene.	resentative. An individual ervene in a contested case	
(b) Prior to withdrawing from a contested case, an attorney shall file a motion to withdraw. The motion for an attorney's withdrawal shall include a statement indicating the manner in which notification was given to the client and setting forth the client's last known address and telephone number. The hearing officer shall not grant the motion to withdraw unless the attorney has made reasonable efforts to give actual notice to the client that:		
(i) The attorney wishes to withdraw;		
(ii) The client has the burden of keeping the heat the address where notices, pleadings, or other papers may be served;	aring officer informed of	
(iii) The client has the obligation to prepare, or or representative to prepare, for the contested case and the dates of pre-	•	
(iv) The client may suffer an adverse determination the client fails or refuses to meet these burdens;	on in the contested case if	
(v) The pleadings and papers in the case shall be sclient's last known address; and	served upon the client at the	
(vi) The client has the right to object within fifteen notice.	(15) days of the date of	
(c) Prior to withdrawing from a contested case, a represent written notice of withdrawal to the Council.	ntative shall provide	
Section 9. Intervention.		

(a)

2-4

Any person interested in obtaining the relief sought by a party or otherwise

interested in the determination of a proceeding, other than surface coal mining operations pending before the Council, may file a motion to intervene before or at the hearing, but not thereafter except for good cause shown. The motion shall set forth the grounds of the proposed intervention, the position and interest of the petitioner in the proceeding, and affirmative relief sought. Leave shall not be granted unless the Council determines that the movant is adversely affected by the action and has a legal right to intervene, under the standards set out in W.R.C.P. Rule 24.

(b) For proceedings related to surface coal mining operations, any person may file a motion for leave to intervene as a full party or in a limited capacity at any stage of a proceeding conducted by the Council. The motion shall include the basis for intervention and shall be granted to any person who either could have initiated the proceeding or has an interest that may be adversely affected by the outcome of the proceeding. Regardless of these bases, intervention may be granted whenever appropriate after considering the nature of the issues, the adequacy of the existing parties' representation of movant's interest, the ability of the movant to present relevant evidence and argument, and the effect of intervention on the implementation of the Wyoming Environmental Quality Act. The extent and terms of participation by an intervenor in a limited capacity shall be determined by the Council.

(c) If the motion to intervene is granted, the movant becomes an intervenor and a party to the proceeding with the right to have notice, appear at the taking of testimony, produce and cross-examine witnesses, and be heard on the argument of the case. The party intervening shall give notice of intervention to all other parties.

Section 10. Ex Parte Communications.

Except as authorized by law, a party or a party's attorney or representative shall not communicate with any Council member in connection with any issue of fact or law concerning any pending contested case, except upon notice and opportunity for all parties to participate. Should ex parte communication occur, the Council member shall advise all parties of the communication as soon as possible thereafter and, if requested, shall allow any party an opportunity to respond prior to ruling on the issue.

Section 11. Motions and Motion Practice.

(a) Unless these rules or an order of the hearing officer establish time limitations other than those contained herein, all motions except motions for enlargement of time and motions made during hearing shall be served at least ten (10) days prior to the hearing on the motion. A party affected by the motion may serve a response together with affidavits, if any, at least three (3) days before the hearing on the motion or within twenty (20) days after service of the motion, whichever is earlier. Unless the hearing officer permits service at some other time, the moving party may serve a reply, if any, at least one day prior to the hearing on the motion or within fifteen (15) days after service of the response, whichever is earlier. Unless the hearing officer otherwise orders, any party may serve supplemental memoranda or rebuttal affidavits at least one day prior to the hearing on the motion.

231	(b) Unless the hearing officer otherwise orders, a request for a hearing on the motion
232	may be served by the moving party or any party affected by the motion within twenty (20)
233	days after service of the motion. The hearing officer may determine such motion without a
234	hearing.
235	
236	(c) Prior to filing any non-dispositive motion, a moving party shall make
237	reasonable efforts to contact all other parties, representatives, and attorneys. Any such non-
238	dispositive motion shall include a statement concerning efforts made to confer with the other
239	party(s) and position(s) on the motion.
240	
241	(d) All written motions filed with the Council shall be accompanied by a proposed
242	order.
243	
244	Section 12. Setting Hearings and Other Proceedings.
245	
246	(a) The hearing officer or Chair of the Council, as applicable, shall assign a docket
247	number to each contested case. All papers, pleadings, motions, and orders filed thereafter shall
248	contain:
249	(i) A comparison on a section of declar annulum
250	(i) A conspicuous reference to the assigned docket number;
251 252	(ii) A caption setting forth the title of the contested case and a brief
252 253	designation describing the document filed; and
253 254	designation describing the document med, and
255	(iii) The name, address, telephone number, and signature of the person
256	who prepared the document.
257	who prepared the document.
258	(b) The hearing officer shall set the course of proceedings through the issuance of a
259	scheduling order. This may include, but is not limited to, pre-hearing conferences,
260	confidentiality issues, summary disposition deadlines, motion practice,
261	settlement conferences, and the evidentiary hearing.
262	,
263	(c) Prehearing conferences may be held at the discretion of the hearing officer. Any
264	party may request a prehearing conference to address issues such as discovery, motion
265	deadlines, scheduling orders, or case status.
266	
267	(d) At the hearing officer's discretion and unless otherwise provided by the
268	Council, telephone or videoconference calls may be used to conduct any proceeding. At the
269	discretion of the hearing officer, parties or their witnesses may be allowed to participate in
270	any hearing by telephone or videoconference.
271	
272	Section 13. Consolidation.
273	
274	A party may seek consolidation of two or more contested cases by filing a motion to

2-6

otherwise ordered by the hearing officer, all subsequent filings shall be in the case first filed,

consolidate in each case sought to be consolidated. If consolidation is ordered and unless

275

276

and all previous filings related to the consolidated cases shall be placed together under that docket number. Consolidation may be ordered on a hearing officer's own motion.

Section 14. Continuances and Extensions of Time.

(a) A motion for a continuance of any scheduled hearing shall be in writing, state the reasons for the motion, and be filed and served on all parties and the hearing officer. A motion for a continuance shall be granted only upon a showing of good cause.

(b) A motion for an extension of time for performing any act prescribed or allowed by these rules or by order of the hearing officer shall be filed and served on all parties and the hearing officer prior to the expiration of the applicable time period. A motion for extension of time shall be granted only upon a showing of good cause.

(c) For contested cases conducted regarding objections pursuant to W.S. 35-11-406(k), a motion for continuance may not be granted if the motion would continue the hearing beyond the 20-day period provided in that statute unless the parties stipulate to a different period.

Section 15. Discovery.

(a) The taking of depositions and discovery shall be in accordance with W.S. 16-3-107(g).

(b) Unless the hearing officer orders otherwise, parties shall not file discovery requests, answers, and deposition notices with the Council.

Section 16. Subpoenas.

Any party may request the hearing officer to issue a subpoena to compel the attendance of a witness or for the production of documents. Requests for a subpoena shall be accompanied by a completed subpoena that conforms to Rule 45 of the Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure.

Section 17. Summary Disposition.

Rules 12(b)(6), 52(c), 56.1, and 56, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, apply to contested cases.

Section 18. Prehearing Procedures.

(a) Unless otherwise ordered by the hearing officer, each party to a contested case shall file and serve on all other parties and the hearing officer a prehearing disclosure statement setting forth:

(i) A complete list of all witnesses who will or may testify, together with

323	information on how that witness may be contacted, and a brief description of the testimony the
324	witness is expected to give in the case. If a deposition is to be offered into evidence, the original
325	shall be filed with the Council;
326	
327	(ii) A statement of the specific claims, defenses, and issues which the
328	party asserts are before the hearing officer for hearing, based on the party's initial filing;
329	
330	(iii) A statement of the burden of proof to be assigned in the contested case
331	with reference to specific regulatory, statutory, constitutional, or other authority established by
332	relevant case law;
333	
334	(iv) A statement of stipulated facts. If the parties are unable to stipulate to
335	facts, the parties shall indicate what efforts have been made to stipulate to facts and the reasons
336	facts cannot be stipulated;
337	
338	(v) A complete list of all documents, statements, etc., which the party will or
339	may introduce into evidence; and
340	
341	(vi) An approximation of the time required for the hearing.
342	
343	(b) Parties shall file and serve prehearing disclosure statements on or before the
344	date established by the hearing officer.
345	
346	(c) The information provided in a prehearing disclosure statement shall be binding on
347	each party throughout the course of the contested case unless modified for good cause.
348	
349	(d) Additional witnesses or exhibits may be added only if the need to do so was
350	not reasonably foreseeable at the time of filing of the prehearing disclosure statement, it would
351	not unfairly prejudice other parties, and good cause is shown.
352	
353	(e) The hearing officer may modify the requirements of a prehearing disclosure
354	statement.
355	
356	(f) Failure to file a prehearing disclosure statement may result in the hearing
357	officer's striking of witnesses, exhibits, claims and defenses, or dismissal of the contested case.
358	
359	(g) If a prehearing order is entered, the prehearing order shall control the
360	course of the hearing.
361	
362	Section 19. Burden of Proof.
363	
364	The hearing officer shall assign the burden of proof in accordance with applicable
365	law.

2-8

366

367 368 Section 20. Evidence.

369	(a) The hearing officer shall rule on the admissibility of evidence in accordance			
370	with the following:			
371				
372	(i) Evidence of the type commonly relied upon by reasonably prudent			
373	persons in the conduct of their serious affairs shall be admissible. Irrelevant, immaterial, or			
374	unduly repetitious evidence shall be excluded.			
375				
376	(ii) Evidence may be offered through witness testimony or in			
377	documentary form;			
378				
379	(iii) Testimony shall be given under oath administered by the hearing			
380	officer. Deposition testimony and other pre-filed testimony may be submitted as evidence,			
381	provided the testimony is given under oath administered by an appropriate authority, and is			
382	subject to cross- examination by all parties;			
383				
384	(iv) The rules of privilege recognized by Wyoming law shall be given			
385	effect; and			
386	(v) A hearing officer may take administrative notice of judicially			
387 388	(v) A hearing officer may take administrative notice of judicially cognizable facts, provided the parties are properly notified of any material facts noticed.			
389	cognizable facts, provided the parties are property notified of any material facts noticed.			
390	(b) Each party shall have the opportunity to cross-examine witnesses. The			
391	hearing officer may allow cross-examination on matters not covered on direct examination.			
392	Each party shall have the opportunity to perform re-direct examination of witnesses on matters			
393	covered during cross-examination.			
394	covered during cross examination.			
395	(c) The hearing officer or Council member, when applicable, may ask questions of			
396	any party or witness.			
397	any party of writtensor			
398	Section 21. Contested Case Hearing Procedure.			
399	2001011			
400	(a) The hearing officer shall conduct the contested case and shall have discretion to			
401	direct the order of the proceedings.			
402				
403	(b) Unless otherwise provided by law, and at the hearing officer's discretion, the			
404	party with the burden of proof shall be the first to present evidence. All other parties			
405	shall be allowed to cross-examine witnesses in an orderly fashion. When that party rests,			
406	other parties shall then be allowed to present their evidence. Rebuttal and surrebuttal evidence			
407	shall be allowed only at the discretion of the hearing officer.			
408				
409	(c) The hearing officer shall have discretion to allow opening statements and			
410	closing arguments.			
411				
412	Section 22. Default.			
413				
414	Unless otherwise provided by law, a hearing officer may enter an order of default or			

an order affirming agency action for a party's failure to appear at a lawfully noticed hearing.

Section 22. Expedited Hearing.

(a) At the hearing officer's or Council's discretion and when allowed by applicable law, a contested case may be heard as an expedited hearing upon the motion of any party.

(b) An expedited hearing shall be decided on written arguments, evidence, and stipulations submitted by the parties. A hearing officer or the Council may permit oral arguments upon the request of any party.

(c) The hearing officer may require an evidentiary hearing in any case in which it appears that facts material to a decision in the case cannot be properly determined by an expedited hearing.

Section 24. Recommended Decision.

In those contested cases where the hearing officer makes a recommended decision, the hearing officer shall file the recommended decision with the Council and serve copies of the recommended decision on all parties to the contested case. Unless otherwise ordered, parties shall have ten (10) days to file written exceptions to the hearing officer's recommended decision. Written exceptions shall be filed with the Council and served on all parties.

Section 25. Final Decision.

(a) A final decision containing findings of fact, conclusions of law, and an order entered by the Council shall be in writing and served upon all parties to the contested case and the hearing officer, if applicable.

(b) A final decision shall include findings of fact and conclusions of law, separately stated. When the hearing officer allows the parties to submit a proposed final order, the parties shall file the original with the Council and serve copies of the proposed order on all other parties and the hearing officer.

(c) A hearing officer may at any time prior to judicial review correct clerical errors in final decisions or other parts of the record. A party may move that clerical errors or other parts of the record be corrected. During the pendency of judicial review, such errors may be corrected only with leave of the court having jurisdiction.

Section 26. Incorporation by Reference.

(a) The code, standard, rule, or regulation below is incorporated by reference and can be found at:

 $http://www.courts.state.wy.us/Documents/CourtRules/Rules/WYOMING_RULES_OF_CIVIL_PROCEDURE.pdf$

461			
462		(i)	Rule 11, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
463	Supreme Cou	ırt and i	n effect on March 1, 2017:
164			
465		(ii)	Rule 12(b)(6), Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the
466	Wyoming Su	preme (Court and in effect on March 1, 2017;
467			
468		(iii)	Rule 24, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
169	Supreme Cou	irt and i	n effect on March 1, 2017;
470 4 7 1		<i>(</i> •)	
471 472	g G	(iv)	Rule 45, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
472 472	Supreme Cou	irt and i	n effect on March 1, 2017;
473 474		()	Dula 52 Wyseming Dulas of Civil Duscodyna adopted by the Wyseming
174 175	Cymrama Cay	(V)	Rule 52, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
475 476	Supreme Cou	irt and n	n effect on March 1, 2017;
+70 177		(vi)	Rule 56, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
+77 478	Supreme Cou	` /	n effect on March 1, 2017;
479	Supreme Cou	irt and i	in critect on whaten 1, 2017,
180		(vii)	Rule 56.1, Wyoming Rules of Civil Procedure, adopted by the Wyoming
481	Supreme Cou	` /	n effect on March 1, 2017.
182	Supreme cou		. • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
183	(b)	These	rules do not incorporate later amendments or editions of the incorporated
184	matter.		r and r r r r r r r r r r r r r r r r r r r
485			
486	(c)	All in	corporated matter is available for public inspection at the Department's
187	Cheyenne off	ice or a	t the Council's Cheyenne office. Contact information for the Department's
488	Cheyenne off	ice may	be obtained at http://deq.wyoming.gov/ or from (307) 777-7937. Contact
189			Council's Cheyenne office may be obtained at http://wyomingeqc.wyo.gov/
190	or from (307)	777-71	170.